

**Minutes of the
Tobacco Education and Research Oversight Committee (TEROC)
Los Angeles Airport Marriott
Denver Conference Room
5855 West Century Boulevard
Los Angeles, CA 90045
Thursday, December 12, 2013**

MEMBERS PRESENT:

Dr. Lourdes Baezconde-Garbanati, Ms. Pat S. Etem, Dr. Lawrence Green, Dr. Alan Henderson, Dr. Pamela Ling, Dr. Michael Ong (Chair), Mr. Myron Dean Quon, Dr. Dorothy Rice, Dr. Shu-Hong Zhu

MEMBERS ABSENT:

Ms. Denise Adams-Simms, Dr. Wendel Brunner

OTHERS IN ATTENDANCE:

Dr. Bart Aoki, Tobacco Related Disease Research Program (TRDRP)/ University of California, Office of the President (UCOP)
Lynn Baskett, Consultant/TEROC Master Plan Writer
Vicki Bauman, Stanislaus County Office of Education
Dr. Phillip Gardiner, TRDRP/UCOP/African American Tobacco Control Leadership Council (AATCLC)
Tom Herman, California Department of Education (CDE)/Coordinate School Health and Safety Office (CSHSO)
Dr. Norval Hickman, TRDRP
Dr. Jonathan Isler, California Tobacco Control Program (CTCP)
Richard Kwong, CTCP
April Roeseler, CTCP
Nadine Roh, CTCP
Alexandria Simpson, CTCP

1. WELCOME, INTRODUCTION, AND OPENING COMMENTS

TEROC Chair, Dr. Ong, called the meeting to order at 9:32 a.m. TEROC members and guests introduced themselves.

2. AGENDA REVIEW

Ms. Baskett guided TEROC through the day's agenda and meeting outcomes were reviewed:

- Confirm objectives for the Master Plan
- Confirm timeline for the Master Plan
- Confirm sub-committees for each objective
- Confirm Vision, Mission, Goal, Principles

3. TIMELINE REVIEW

The Master Plan timeline was reviewed and highlighted.

4. FIELD SURVEY

TEROC Members discussed the direction of the next Master Plan. The field survey findings were reviewed by TEROC. There were 140 participants, including the TRDRP supplemental survey. A summary of the survey and highlights was distributed to TEROC as part of the meeting agenda materials. The target audience of the Master Plan remains the Legislature.

Dissemination challenges were highlighted. Agency staff and the Dissemination Committee will evaluate dissemination strategies. TEROC discussed the format of the Master Plan and was interested in greater use of the Internet.

Action Items

At the next TEROC meeting, CTCP staff will present options and timelines for print and online versions of the Master Plan as well as using links to additional information in the body of the document.

5. MASTER PLAN OUTLINE

TEROC agreed to retain the current seven objectives and asked the sub-committees to review the strategies and narrative related to each of the objectives and to strengthen or clarify the wording of Objectives #2 and #4.

- e-Cigarettes will be incorporated into each objective.
 - An introductory section, "Changing Landscape" will be included.
- Potential points to be addressed include:

- a) Tobacco control is in a limited and declining resource environment
 - b) The tobacco control infrastructure has been dramatically weakened/dismantled due to funding reductions over the past few years
 - c) Proliferation of new products
 - d) Continued high prevalence of tobacco use in priority populations
 - e) Implications under the Affordable Care Act re: population health and disease management
 - f) Address global leadership and evaluation of lives and money saved, perhaps in the Changing Landscape section instead of the strategies under Objective #2 (Strengthen the Tobacco Control Infrastructure)
 - g) Public and private partnerships and networks are particularly critical for cultural and linguistic competence, access, trust, relationships building, additional expertise and avoiding conflicts of interest. This is in conflict with current CDPH legal counsel interpretation of Government Code Section 19130
 - h) Legalization of marijuana
 - i) Marijuana co-use
 - j) Retail environment
 - k) Rapidity of change within the tobacco industry, (e.g., co-opting language, youth development programs and environmental groups; predatory marketing practices, use of media, etc.)
 - l) Acknowledge that vaporists don't self-identify as smokers; threat to the years of de-normalizing tobacco and smoking
 - m) Industry efforts to define language and to change norms
 - n) Stress that vapor is in fact smoking
 - o) Funding formula tension between equity of resources and disparity of needs for infrastructure funding
 - p) While the environment has changed, the goal of saving lives has not changed
- Highlight the significance of e-cigarettes visually as well as by integrating the topic into each objective.
 - The Master Plan will specify that when the word tobacco is used, it includes any and all tobacco and tobacco-derivative products including the e-Cigarettes and the full range of nicotine delivery system products.
 - As appropriate, note where strategies relate to more than one objective.

6. MASTER PLAN MISSION, VISION, GOALS, AND PRINCIPLES

The current Master Plan Mission and Vision were re-affirmed with the notation that “tobacco-related” and “tobacco-free” include any and all tobacco and tobacco-derivative products including e-cigarettes and the full range of nicotine delivery system products.

The Master Plan Goal will be updated to read as follows:

To achieve tobacco-use prevalence rates in California of 10 percent for adults and eight percent for high-school age youth by December, 2017. Tobacco use includes any and all types of tobacco and tobacco-derivative products including e-cigarettes and the full range of nicotine delivery system products.

TEROC reviewed the Principles for Tobacco Control in California and recommended adding the concept of sustainability, potentially in the first principle. Patricia Etem and Alan Henderson agreed to edit the Principles and bring them back to TEROC for discussion.

7. SUBCOMMITTEES

TEROC discussed the role of subcommittees. The first task for the subcommittees is to review the objective wording and strategies for updates no later than January 15, 2014 so that the updates can be compiled for the January TEROC meeting. The following sub-committees were created by TEROC:

Objective	Lead	Participants
#1 Tobacco tax	Michael Ong	Dorothy Rice
#2 Infrastructure	Alan Henderson	Pat Etem
#3 Equity	Myron Quon	Denise Adams-Simms
#4 Impact on people and environment	Lourdes Baezconde-Garbanati	Wendell Brunner
#5 Prevent initiation	Vicki Bauman	Lourdes Baezconde-Garbanati
#6 Cessation	Shu-Hong Zhu	Michael Ong
#7 Tobacco industry	Pam Ling	Larry Green
Principles	Pat Etem	Alan Henderson

The existing e-cigarette sub-committee will review all the objectives to identify any gaps after the sub-committees have developed their recommendations for TEROC.

Action Items

Dr. Green moved that TEROC Subcommittees meet to develop recommended updates to the key sections for the Master Plan. The subcommittees will take their recommendations and present them at the next TEROC meeting. Dr. Baezconde-Garbanati seconded the motion; motion passed unanimously.

8. MASTER PLAN OBJECTIVES

TEROC discussed each of the current Master Plan objectives to confirm or edit the wording of the objective and the current strategies. In the brainstorming process, comments fell into 3 categories: changes to the

objective or strategies, points to consider including in the narrative that goes with each objective, and points to consider including in the introductory “Changing Landscape” section of the Master Plan. The summary of the discussion of each objective follows.

Objective 1: Raise the Tobacco Tax

Strategies:

- Tax e-cigarettes
- Tie increase in the tobacco tax to increases in the Consumer Price Index (CPI).

Narrative:

- Tobacco includes tobacco-derivative products and define the threshold level of tobacco/nicotine required to be covered by tobacco control regulations (currently 50 percent tobacco for products)
- Objective #1 or #2--Consider alternative ways to increase revenue for tobacco control

Include call-out box on SEIU initiative to increase the tobacco tax by \$2.00/pack.

Objective 2 Strengthen the Tobacco Control Infrastructure

Strategies:

- Delete strategies #5 and #6; address global leadership and evaluation of lives and money saved elsewhere, perhaps Changing Landscape section
- Leverage expertise and local relationships through public-private partnerships to maximize impact of tobacco control funds on tobacco-use prevalence
- Government Code Section 19130 contracting issue—Develop umbrella language on exemptions to support interdependence and use of public-private partnerships, demonstrated outcomes and results
- #1 consider cooperation and coordination instead of collaboration. Synergy instead of leverage
- #4 add surveillance and monitoring (to note emerging trends and whether or not strategies are being implemented effectively)

Landscape:

- Importance of local partnerships to avoid conflict of interest, additional expertise, cultural and linguistic competence, trust, grassroots relationships, etc.

Narrative:

- Talk about why it is so important to have partnerships, e.g. avoid conflict of interest, expertise, cultural and linguistic competence, trust, grassroots relationships
- Potential partners: Medi-Cal, CA Covered, Board of Equalization, First 5, CTCP, CDC, TRDRP, community-based organizations (CBOs)

- Interdependence of government and CBOs
- Examples of public-private successes, e.g. Boys and Girls Clubs, for recruitment of youth for testing retail sales compliance
- LLA and LEA need local partners, CBOs, with whom to work to be effective
- Local partners needed to track, identify emerging products, issues and needed strategies that will be effective
- Continue support for Behavioral Risk Factor Surveillance System (BRFSS) and other surveys of youth smoking prevalence
- Address distribution formula, e.g. Amador and LA counties get the same amount of tobacco control grant funds.

Objective 3: Achieve Equity in All Aspects of Tobacco Control among California's Diverse Populations

Strategies:

- Accelerate the rate of decrease in disparities for priority populations; white vs. priority population smoking prevalence declining at the same rate but priority populations prevalence rate is still higher.
- #2 add language access with cultural competence
- #5 add surveillance and monitoring
- Enforce policies and regulations that ensure social justice, e.g. predatory marketing of menthol cigarettes to African-American (AA) men, lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender (LGBT) community.

Landscape:

- Public and private partnerships and networks are particularly critical—cultural and linguistic competence, access, trust, and relationships building

Narrative:

- Be sure to include definition of priority populations
- Include health equity summit graphs that highlight the impact on low-income populations
- E-cigarettes are now most prevalent in higher income, white male populations; however, it is just a matter of time until the industry focuses on low-income priority populations.
- The digital divide and current higher cost of eCigarettes is a temporary barrier for marketing to priority populations.
- Predatory strategies that worked in the past will be used for e-cigarettes down the road
- Flavored cigarettes, e-cigarettes, mini cigars, and flavored smokeless alternatives are targeted toward the youth
- Public and private partnerships and networks are particularly critical—cultural and linguistic competence, access, trust, and relationships building

Objective 4: Minimize the Impact of Tobacco Use on People and Tobacco Waste on the Environment

Strategies:

- Title too vague
- #2 note equity issue in statement
- #3 add e-cigarettes
- Add third-hand smoke: exposure to toxins; data not yet in on health impacts

Narrative:

- Use 'social interrupters' in tobacco control
- e-cigarettes waste/hazards: lithium batteries into landfill, exploding e-cigarettes, partially empty cartridges resulting in calls to Poison Control Center
- Disposable e-cigarettes are cheaper and more accessible and will generate more waste
- 4-6 mg nicotine can kill a child. A partial cartridge, especially with flavor, is a choking hazard and potentially lethal to a child (potential partners—Consumer Safety Board, Parent Teacher Association (PTA) and other organizations interested in child safety/toy safety.

Objective 5: Prevent the Initiation of Tobacco Use

Strategies:

- Strategy #6 add surveillance and monitoring

Landscape:

- Legalization of marijuana
- Marijuana co-use
- De-normalizing marijuana

Narrative:

- Cavi—hollow out cigar and add marijuana or other drugs
- Youth and e-cigarettes
- Include smoke free movies in Objective # 5 or 7

Objective 6: Increase the Number of Californians Who Quit Using Tobacco

Strategies:

- #3 add providers, health care systems, Covered California/Health Benefit Exchange (HBX), include patient tobacco use and tobacco education in physical and mental health electronic medical records.
- Include points from Dr. Ling's pending publication—abstracts to TEROC from Ms. Roeseler.
- #5 add surveillance and monitoring

Narrative:

- Acknowledge community belief that e-cigarettes are a harm reduction strategy
- Acknowledge industry co-opting of the term “harm reduction.”
- Literature remains unclear on whether e-cigarettes are an effective cessation device. More research needed.
- Other effective, demonstrated alternatives exist—use those.
- Is there research that the co-use of tobacco and e-cigarettes is the norm or more common?

Objective 7: Minimize tobacco Industry Influence and Activities

Landscape:

- Acknowledge that vaporists don’t self-identify as smokers; threat to the years of de-normalizing tobacco and smoking.
- Industry efforts to define language and to change norms
- Stress vaping is in fact smoking

Narrative:

- Include tobacco, e-products, and advertising industries
- In objective #7 and/or #5—Tobacco industry strategy of aligning with youth development, (e.g. support of Botvin life skills training program).
- In objective #4 or 7, how tobacco industry has co-opted environmental groups in the past.
- Online sales of e-cigarettes and the need for regulation of tobacco products
- New language, e-cigarette, vaping, use of social media to promote/market e-cigarettes
- Examples of industry efforts to normalize: Darth Vapor t-shirt, flavors like Sweet Buns, Vaporfest in October, September 19 is International Vapor Day
- Research: monitoring and surveillance of Internet, e.g. twitter, Facebook, blogs, for language and product trends
- Cottage industry of e-cigarettes retail sales locations, e.g. strip mall vacancies filled with e-cigarette vendors
- Wells Fargo market shelf space study allocation shows significant increase in tobacco-derivative product space allocation

9. THEMES

TEROC reviewed the themes from the past Master Plans and brainstormed ideas for the 2015-2017 Master Plan. A Survey Monkey will be distributed to TEROC members to solicit initial feedback on the ideas generated. At the January TEROC meeting, TEROC will select a theme, which the graphic artist will use to develop cover options for the 2015-2017 Master Plan.

Theme ideas generated include:

- eEliminate Tobacco
- Changing Landscape
- Vapor Couture
- Virginia Slims All Over Again
- eCigarettes: High Tech Product, Low Tech Results
- Emerging Threats
- Urgency
- Section 19130 & e-cigarettes: A Communist Plot
- Harm to Kids
- Environmental Damage
- From our Success in De-Normalizing Tobacco to the Industry's success in normalizing e-cigarettes

10. NEXT STEPS

Sub-committees will meet and submit their recommendations on the wording of the objectives and any changes/additions or deletions to the strategies for each objective no later than January 15, 2014.

At the January TEROC meeting members will approve the Master Plan outline, select a theme for the Master Plan and finalize the strategies for each objective.

11. PUBLIC COMMENT

No public comment.

Dr. Ong moved to adjourn the meeting. The motion passed unanimously.

The meeting was adjourned at 3:35 PM.

A two-day TEROC meeting will be scheduled for February 2014.